HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION

March 16, 2022

HDRC CASE NO:	2022-120
ADDRESS:	1938 W MISTLETOE
LEGAL DESCRIPTION:	NCB 1964 BLK 2 LOT 11
ZONING:	R-6,H
CITY COUNCIL DIST.:	7
DISTRICT:	Monticello Park Historic District
APPLICANT:	Rusty Beanland/Tuff Shed San Antonio
OWNER:	BARRERA NELDA G
TYPE OF WORK:	Construction of a 1-story rear accessory structure
APPLICATION RECEIVED:	February 16, 2022
60-DAY REVIEW:	Not applicable due to City Council Emergency Orders
CASE MANAGER:	Stephanie Phillips

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 1-story rear accessory structure measuring 440 square feet.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements. ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures. B. ROOF FORM i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on non-residential building types are more typically flat and screened by an omamental parapet wall.

C. RELATIONSHIP OF SOLIDS TO VOIDS

i. *Window and door openings*—Incorporate window and door openings with a similar proportion of wall to window space as typical with nearby historic facades. Windows, doors, porches, entryways, dormers, bays, and pediments shall be considered similar if they are no larger than 25% in size and vary no more than 10% in height to width ratio from adjacent historic facades.

ii. *Façade configuration*— The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*— New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

B. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

Salvaged materials—Incorporate salvaged historic materials where possible within the context of the overall design of the new structure.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more omate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate. iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.

ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.

iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.

iv. *Windows and doors*—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions. v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used. ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

Standard Specifications for Windows in Additions and New Construction

- GENERAL: New windows on additions should relate to the windows of the primary historic structure in terms
 of materiality and overall appearance. Windows used in new construction should be similar in appearance to
 those commonly found within the district in terms of size, profile, and configuration. While no material is
 expressly prohibited by the Historic Design Guidelines, a high-quality wood or aluminum-clad wood window
 product often meets the Guidelines with the stipulations listed below. Whole window systems should match the
 size of historic windows on property unless otherwise approved.
- SIZE: Windows should feature traditional dimensions and proportions as found within the district.
- SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25". Stiles must be no wider than 2.25". Top and bottom sashes must be equal in size unless otherwise approved.
- DEPTH: There should be a minimum of $\hat{2}$ " in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash.
 - This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.
- TRIM: Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- GLAZING: Windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- COLOR: Wood windows should feature a painted finished. If a clad product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- INSTALLATION: Wood windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation. For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

FINDINGS:

- a. The primary structure located at 1938 W Mistletoe is a 1-story residential structure constructed circa 1935. The home features a cut limestone veneer façade, one over one windows, and an asymmetrical front porch. The structure is located at the intersection of W Mistletoe and Vollum Blvd and is contributing to the Monticello Park Historic District. The applicant is proposing to construct a new 2 car garage at the rear of the property. A side double-width concrete pad and driveway already exists to service this location.
- b. WORK STARTED PRIOR TO APPROVAL The foundation was framed and poured prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. The applicant applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness upon notification from OHP staff that review and approval was required. The work has since ceased pending the review and approval of the proposed structure.
- c. SETBACKS According to the Guidelines for New Construction 5.B.ii., historic setback pattern of similar structures along the block should be followed. Staff finds that the proposed setbacks are consistent with the historic development pattern along the block. The applicant may require a variance from the Board of Adjustment and is responsible for complying with setback requirements as necessitated by the Development Services Department.
- d. SCALE AND MASS The proposed new accessory is a 1-story structure with a footprint of 440 square feet. According to the Guidelines, new rear structures should be designed to be visually subordinate to the principal structure in terms of their height, massing, and form. Staff finds that the new structure does not overwhelm or visually compete with the main structure and is consistent with existing accessory structure heights and development patterns in the vicinity.
- e. ROOF FORM The proposed new structure features a primary gable configuration. The roof will feature asphalt shingles to match the existing primary structure. According to the Guidelines, similar roof forms, pitches, and overhangs should be used on new accessory structures as the primary structure and historic structures in the vicinity. Staff finds the proposed roof form consistent with the Guidelines.
- f. WINDOWS AND DOORS The proposed structure includes two single-bay garage doors and a single pedestrian door. The materials are not clearly indicated. According to the Guidelines for New Construction 2.C.i, window and door openings should have a similar proportion of wall to window space as typical with nearby historic facades. Staff finds the proposed pedestrian door and garage doors consistent with the Guidelines with the stipulations listed in the recommendation.
- g. MATERIALITY The applicant has proposed to utilize lap siding, asphalt shingle roofing, and steel garage doors. The specific pedestrian door material is not indicated. Staff finds the proposal generally consistent with the Guidelines with the stipulations in the recommendation.
- h. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS According to the Guidelines, new accessory structures should incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the style of the original structure. Staff finds the proposal generally consistent with the Guidelines.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through h with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant installs fully wood, single-bay garage doors or garage doors with a design that mimics wood construction and features a smooth finish without a faux wood grain texture. Final garage door specifications must be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant submits all final material specifications to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. If fiber cement siding or skirting is used, boards should feature a smooth finish with a maximum reveal of six inches or reveal to match the existing historic structure. Faux grain is not permitted.
- iii. That the applicant complies with all setback requirements as required by Zoning and obtains a variance from the Board of Adjustment if applicable.

City of San Antonio One Stop



March 11, 2022

CoSA Parcels BCAD Parcels

	CoSAAddresses	0	0.01	0.02	0.04 mi
÷	Community Service Centers	0	0.0175	0.035	0.07 km
	Pre-K Sites				





Sundance Ranch Garage 22' X 20' Roof Pitch: 4/12 Customer: Matthew `Thomas

Drawn By: KBMax This document was auto generated on: Fri Jan 28 2022 18:55:54 GMT+0000 (Coordinated Universal Time)

WALL B DIMENS IN INCHES

Bottom Plate Length: 233

Matthew Thomas 1938 west mistletoe san antonio TX 78201 Q4520860-4513536

Wall B

Base Details

Building Size & Style Sundance Ranch Garage - 22' wide by 20' long Door Overhead Garage Door (8' x 7'), Door 6-Panel Residential Door (Left Hand Inswing), **Paint Selection** Base: Knight's Armor, Trim: Delicate White **Roof Selection** Charcoal 3 Tab Drip Edge White Is a permit required for this job? Yes Who is pulling the permit? **Tuff Shed**

Options Details

Doors Overhead Garage Door (8' x 7'), 6-Panel Residential Door (Right Hand Inswing), Vents

2 Ea 12"x12"Gable End Vent, White

Jobsite/Installer Details

Do you plan to insulate this building after Tuff Shed installs it? No

Is there a power outlet within 100 feet of installation location?

Yes The building location must be level to properly install the building. How level is the install location? Slab provided by customer will be within ½" tolerance on square, level, exterior dimensions to match the building size (per customer agreement).

Will there be 18" of unobstructed workspace around the perimeter of all four walls?

Yes Can the installers park their pickup truck & trailer within approximately 200' of your installation site? Yes

Substrate Shed will be installed on? Concrete without Shed Floor

Signature: _

Date:

Traditional Raised Panel 25 Gauge

RAISED PANELS

Traditional Raised Panel

Constructed of top quality materials, highly detailed raised panel, deep woodgrain texture, and two coat prefinished paint system all combine to enhance the beauty of your home.

- 25 gauge steel
- 1.0 mil paint with 3 color options
- 8 window options
- R-value 6.85 *511 Feature
- Vinyl interior skin *511 Feature

↑ WHITE

Traditional Raised Panel 25 Gauge

FEATURES

25 GAUGE STEEL

Hot dipped galvanized steel construction with hemmed inside return rail provides superior strength and durability.

ROLLED SAFETY EDGES ON SECTION JOINTS

Eliminates sharp edges, and provides extra strength.

19 GAUGE HOT DIPPED GALVANIZED STILES

Heavy duty metal stiles give strong rigid support for all hinges, rollers, and operator attachment.

STILES ATTACHED WITH RIVETS

Provides superior strength when compared to common sheet metal joining methods.

TONGUE AND GROOVE MEETING RAILS

For superior strength and better sealing against wind, rain, and snow.

RIGID ALUMINUM RETAINER WITH WEATHERSTRIP

Provides added strength while securing replaceable U-type bottom astragal weatherstrip to help keep the elements out.

R-VALUE 6.85

Enhances your home's energy savings, makes your door operation quieter, and reduces exterior noise in your garage. *511 Feature

HIGH IMPACT PLASTIC BACK COVER

Protects the insulation, and enhances the interior look of your garage door. *511 Feature

CFC FREE EXPANDED POLYSTYRENE

Environmentally friendly insulation that will not degrade with vibration or time. *511 Feature

WINDOW GLASS OPTIONS

See website for glass options

SIZE OPTIONS

HEIGHTS: 6'6", 6'9", 7'0", 7'6", 7'9", 8'0"

5700 NW 39th St, Riverside, MO 64150 816-474-3900 / sales@doorlinkmfg.com © doorLink Manufacturing, Inc.

@IDA DASMA

WINDOW OPTIONS

Not all glazing options may be available from all distributors. No glazing on 18" sections.

PAINT LAYERS

1.0 MIL PAINT SYSTEM

Includes .25 mil rust inhibiting primer and .75 mil exterior top coat that resists fading and chalking, while providing consistent color from panel to panel and more durability.

- 1 Paint - .75 MIL
- 2 Primer - .25 MIL
- 3 Steel
- Paint .3 MIL
- 1 Tongue and groove meeting rails
- 2 Hemmed interior rails
- 3 2" thick section
- 19 gauge hot dipped galvanized 4 steel stiles
- 5 CFC free expanded polystyrene insulation with vinyl backing (standard on 511)
- 6 Replaceable U-Type vinyl bottom weatherstrip
- 7 Extruded aluminum weatherstrip retainer

*This image is showing 511

See what this door looks like on your own home at doorLinkmfg.com

- 4 Primer - .2 MIL 5

CONSTRUCTION

RAISED PANELS

GAF

Marquis WeatherMax Charcoal 3-Tab Roofing Shingles (33.3 sq. ft. per Bundle) (26pieces)

★★★★ (30) ✓ Questions & Answers (20)

Hover Image to Zoom

LP[®] SMARTSIDE[®] TRIM & SIDING INDUSTRY LEADING WARRANTY

LASTS LONGER.

5-YEAR, 100% LABOR & MATERIAL REPLACEMENT

LP will cover 100% of the labor and moterial cost in the event of a siding replacement in the first 5 years.

50-YEAR PRORATED MATERIAL REPLACEMENT

After the first 5 years, LP will cover a partion of the material cost in the event of a siding replacement until the 50th year.

PROTECTS MORE.

FUNGAL DECAY & TERMITE RESISTANCE Treated with waxes, resins and zinc borate to help resist fungal decay and termites

HAIL COVERAGE For damage up to 1.75 inches

INCORRECT INSTALLATION DOES NOT VOID ENTIRE WARRANTY Incorrectly installed products are the only portion voided

PROVIDES FLEXIBILITY.

LP* SmartSide* features one comprehensive warranty for its entire line. It is possible to mix and match LP* SmartSide* with other exterior siding options and still retain the warranty for design flexibility.

Internet bulletin (PCrimitine

2019 Louisiana Pacho Corporation. All righty inserved. All admitants are carried by Lincourse Pacific Corporation.

Nerrains only applicable when the product is property metalistated and maintained according to 1.P⁴ binaribide" product

Hover Image to Zoom